

Biennial Report on Activities 2013-2014

The Pugwash Conferences on Science and World Affairs



Nobel Peace Prize 1995





Since its founding in 1957, the goal of the Pugwash Conferences on Science and World Affairs has been primarily to warn against the risk that the use of nuclear weapons could destroy civilization and possibly mankind. In particular, the Russell-Einstein Manifesto, as the founding document, emphasized the resolution of conflict with a view to ending all war.

Pugwash advocates nuclear disarmament, eliminating all weapons of mass destruction (WMD), and preventing nuclear proliferation. As Pugwash has adapted to the post-Cold War world, we also focus on facilitating conflict resolution by means of dialogue, particularly by engaging a wide range of policy makers, leaders, and scientists, especially in regions where nuclear weapons are a security issue.

Pugwash workshops engage current and former policy makers and opinion shapers who participate in their personal capacities, according to Pugwash/Chatham House rules (the substance can be reported out but not attributed to any one person). Because of this arrangement, our workshops tend to produce insightful and targeted recommendations that often find their way into the corridors of power through reports and personal post-workshop meetings and briefings.

Pugwash has national groups and close contacts in some 50 countries, and offices in Rome, London, Washington DC, and Geneva.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Message from the Secretary General and President 3

Feature: 2015 Activities 3

Activities by issue area:

Nuclear Disarmament 4

Focus: The Iran Nuclear Issue 4

The Middle East 5

Focus: The Syrian Crisis and Chemical Weapons disarmament... 5

South Asia 6

Focus: Afghanistan 6

Special Feature: 60th Pugwash Conference, Istanbul, November 2013 7

Pugwash Council 9

Pugwash Donors 9

A Message from the Secretary General and President

As we look forward to the 61st Pugwash Conference in Nagasaki in November 2015, this report summarizes the wide range of activities undertaken since 2013. The 60th Pugwash Conference in Istanbul was a tremendous success for our organization, garnering great interest around the world and featuring a very high calibre of participation.

The over-arching Pugwash priority is to promote nuclear and other WMD disarmament. The Greater Middle East is a key area of focus given the insecurities, the presence of nuclear weapons and the possible dangers of future proliferation in the region. In Afghanistan, Pugwash has held a ground-breaking series of meetings to promote peaceful reconciliation between all parties, with the belief that all people should be encouraged to seek a political solution that eschews violence.

The region has continued to be in flux: from Egypt to Afghanistan, the need for dialogue is urgent given the increasingly complex dynamics. Nuclear disarmament and non-proliferation efforts are embedded in the general security situation, which includes the rise of extremism and the resolution of long-standing territorial issues.

Through our Track 2 efforts we have sought to inject fresh thinking into the stale policy debates and to deepen the Track 2 experiences of the community of talented people in the region who are able to

promote these concepts domestically and internationally. The 'dialogue across divides' that is the hallmark of Pugwash work has helped to enhance understanding of the regional dynamics and prospects for avoiding further escalatory conflict.

Our work has aided policymakers in the West to better appreciate the perspectives of people in the regions. Our focus on maintaining relations and fostering dialogue between the West and Iran with respect to its nuclear programme has been widely appreciated in that country and the region more widely. Meetings in Israel continue to provide feedback on the Iranian nuclear issue, as well as the peace process there. Our work on Syria and the rise of extremism in general has fostered understanding on the most pressing of challenges for the region currently.

We continue to promote cooperation between the political, intelligence, and military establishments of India and Pakistan to understand each other's nuclear programmes, as well as work to a resolution in Kashmir.

In Europe and North America, Pugwash continues its work of providing clear analysis of the threat posed by the status quo of nuclear weapons. Furthermore, we push for the relevant political circles to decrease the salience of nuclear weapons and advocate the goal of a world free of nuclear weapons.

Pugwash continues its policy of co-operating with and supporting the UN in its activities, upholding disarmament and security treaties and agreements, as well as building new norms.

Pugwash as an organization relies on the goodwill of all those who attend and participate in its meetings. We are also indebted to those who continue to provide funding for the important work we undertake throughout the world.



**Pugwash President
Jayantha Dhanapala**



**Pugwash Secretary General
Paolo Cotta-Ramusino**

Highlights of our 2015 activities

- Meeting on Afghan reconciliation, Doha, 2-3 May 2015
- Workshop on Prospects for the 2015 NPT Review Conference, New York City, 16 May 2015
- Workshop on the Iran Nuclear Issue, Herzliya, 5-6 June 2015
- Consultations on Palestine, Ramallah, 7-8 June 2015

Nuclear Disarmament

Pugwash has continued its activities promoting a world free of nuclear weapons and other weapons of mass destruction, and the longer-term goal of a world free of war. Pugwash is an integral part of the global efforts to foster understanding of the urgency of disarmament and the need for conflict resolution in areas where nuclear risks are present.

Our strategy is to continue to promote that vision widely, while working to create dialogue across divides on steps needed to achieve that end. We get beyond the rhetoric and entrenched positions by fostering dialogue on ways in which working toward these goals can increase the security of all sides.



In the past two years major emphasis has been placed on efforts to promote a peaceful resolution of the Iranian nuclear issue (see box below). Progress



at the official level in this period has been substantial; in its Track 2 meetings, Pugwash has sought to highlight key scientific issues, and demonstrate that the main technical issues are resolvable if political will can be mustered.

Pugwash has continued promoting a WMD Free Zone in the Middle East during a series of meetings at the NPT Review Conference in 2014, in the United Nations in New York, as well as in our related meetings internationally.

Pugwash continues its more traditional work promoting arms control and disarmament measures, including our long-term and influential support for efforts to reinforce the norm in favor of a nuclear weapons free world. We seek to advance European security through next steps in confidence-building, arms control, and

disarmament. In September 2014 Pugwash convened a meeting with the support of the Flemish Peace Institute in Brussels on 'The Future of Nuclear Weapons in Europe'. This event engaged key US experts with leading European thinkers on these issues. The role of outside players (including the US, Europe, and NATO) to our other core regions of interest is also an integral part of discussions.



We continue to support on-going educational efforts to promote understanding of the key role Pugwash played throughout the Cold War. Through our Pugwash History Project we presented an overview of Pugwash's impact during the Cold War, at Stanford University's Hoover Institution, and participated in Tokyo and Nagasaki meetings observing the 60th anniversary of the Lucky Dragon incident and its links to the Russell-Einstein manifesto

Focus: The Iran Nuclear Issue

In the ten years that the international community has considered the Iranian nuclear issue Pugwash has consistently promoted a peaceful and non-military resolution by engaging key individuals from all sides to foster regional dialogue. Iranian Foreign Minister Javad Zarif and other Iranian officials participated at our 60th International Conference. The series of meetings on this issue in Israel has continued, along with related meetings in Washington, D.C., and many private consultations in relevant capitals, including Tehran, Moscow, and China. Pugwash seeks to promote greater understanding of the threat perceptions for all sides through this series of consultations and roundtables. Additionally, a ground breaking workshop was held in Rome on "Oil & Gas Markets in the Aftermath of the Iranian Nuclear Talks."



*Herzliya, Israel, November 2014
workshop on Iran nuclear issue*

The Middle East

Increasingly, emergent regional and global dynamics have led Pugwash to prioritize focus on regions that present serious challenges to the effectiveness of the Non-Proliferation Treaty as well as the other major conventions and treaties that support the goals of WMD non-proliferation. The Middle East, with its many complexities and challenges, is a key area of focus for the organization.



The Iran nuclear issue holds the potential to not only further destabilize the Middle East region but also to undermine the NPT regime (see box on previous page). Pugwash created opportunities for people from this very tense regional environment to meet across dividing lines. In meetings and consultations in Tel Aviv, Washington, and New York, Pugwash promoted restraint within Israeli and US political circles vis-à-vis a possible military attack on

Iranian nuclear facilities. Our “proposed framework agreement” on the Iranian nuclear crisis was discussed at very high levels in several capitals and contributed to the climate that made possible an interim nuclear deal with Iran. We continue to be engaged with high level Iranians, from meetings in Tehran to Foreign Minister Zarif and other officials speaking at our 60th Pugwash Conference (see p.7).

Inaction on the Middle East Weapons of Mass Destruction Free Zone initiative also threatens the NPT regime and has reverberations in the wider disarmament debate. Our discussions in various forums and in various contexts on the future of a Middle East WMD Free Zone have continued to urge creative thinking on this important issue.

Our work on Syria has helped to provide a bridge between those independent voices seeking a resolution of the conflict and those technical experts working on chemical weapons issues, humanitarian access, and arms control issues (see box below).

In a number of meetings in the West Bank and Gaza, Pugwash has

discussed the future of Palestine with Fatah and Hamas, and encouraged parties to consider concrete steps for reconciliation. In the midst of the 2014 Gaza war a London workshop explored options for opening Gaza for trade and free movement of people, prospects for inter-Palestinian reconciliation, the unity government, and the future of a two-state solution, and what the international community can do on these issues. We have also been able to discuss the issue of Palestine with Israeli interlocutors with concern that the Arab Spring and the Iranian nuclear issue were eclipsing focus on the Israel-Palestine issue.



Despite the rapidly changing political environment in the region, we have encouraged discussion on the regional security situation in all of our meetings.

Focus: Syria crisis and chemical weapons disarmament

In response to the crisis in Syria, beginning in mid-2013 Pugwash convened a series of consultations and workshops to explore what Track 2 dialogue could do to assist the international community. This series was largely driven by reports of chemical weapons use and by the request of civil society in Syria for help: Pugwash provided the opportunity for Syrian NGOs to interact with top-level Russians and Iranians during 2014, as part of an effort to provide options for de-escalating the violence. Meetings and consultations in Geneva, Dubai, London and Paris have been widely regarded as highly valuable; in particular, several leading Syrian civil society organizations have put forward a plan for building a bottom-up peace, by building on the success of local mini-ceasefires.



*Geneva, January 2014
Consultation on the Syrian crisis*

South Asia

Pugwash has remained deeply involved in South Asia, organizing Track 2 dialogues on the future of Afghanistan, Kashmir, regional relations, and confidence building measures about nuclear weapons and military cooperation. Instability in the region is profound, given the situation in Afghanistan, and the current low ebb of the India-Pakistan strategic relationship. Pugwash has stressed the need to create a counter-narrative to continuing conflict.



Pugwash remains active in its efforts to convene dialogues with all parties relevant to a lasting and secure peace in Afghanistan (see box below). We work closely on these issues with both our Afghanistan Pugwash group and our Pakistan Pugwash group. In particular, we have made additional connections with Taliban leadership, and have had a series of efforts in this respect that have created conditions that made possible initial exploratory Afghan-

led meetings involving participants on all sides, including the Taliban. These meetings have been considered useful in the gradual process of seeking dialogue on the future of Afghanistan and have led to a series of consultations and a ground-breaking meeting in Doha in 2015. Such advances demonstrate the necessity for on-going engagement on this track.

India and Pakistan continue to have significant differences that, as nuclear-armed neighbors, pose serious risks. There are also critical local dimensions that are integral to the security concerns of many states which Pugwash believes need to be addressed in a wider conversation about regional security. Meetings and consultations in both capitals have continued with the belief that it is crucial that dialogue between Pakistan and India can reduce tensions in this region and promote a spirit of cooperation and stability.

The situation in Kashmir has been complex during the past years: a period of no government there and the situation surrounding Indian elections created a political deadlock in Kashmir, with different political parties having strongholds

in different areas. Throughout 2013-14 Pugwash held a series of meetings and consultations in Delhi, Islamabad and Srinagar on issues related to peace and stability. In September 2013 Pugwash convened a major workshop in Islamabad to discuss ways to improve the connections across the Line of Control, options for eliminating the restrictions that limit the movement and the freedom of the people in the entire region, and prospect to promote economic cooperation and development in the entire region



Pugwash maintains regular communication with various sides in the region, with a view toward holding a larger Pugwash meeting in the region in the near future.

Focus: Afghanistan

Pugwash has continued its series of meetings in support of the talks and the negotiations aiming at a peaceful future for Afghanistan. We aim to promote dialogue and reconciliation between the differing groups within Afghan society (including people connected with insurgents). With the creation of a new Afghan Pugwash group, Pugwash organized a major meeting in January 2013 in Dubai to discuss reconciliation and has conducted numerous consultations in Afghanistan, the region, and key capitals globally. This work has led to a ground-breaking meeting in Doha in May 2015, bringing together many groups within Afghanistan.



January 2013, Dubai meeting on Afghan reconciliation

Special Feature:

The 60th Pugwash Conference in Istanbul

From 1-5 November 2013, The Pugwash Conferences on Science and World Affairs convened the 60th Pugwash Conference, “Dialogue, Disarmament, and Regional and Global Security.” The conference created a space for 200 people from 40 countries to sit together and discuss key issues on the international and regional agendas. Participants included acting government officials, former government or diplomatic members, scientists, media and other opinion leaders from all sides, and young Pugwashites from science and academia.



In an increasingly complex international environment, Pugwash continues to focus on the need to decrease the salience of nuclear weapons, to promote further significant reductions in existing arsenals, and to avoid the proliferation of nuclear weapons. Pugwash also promotes conflict prevention and resolution in areas of nuclear risk, including work in South Asia (including groundbreaking meetings on Afghanistan) and the Middle East (featuring high level meetings on Iran, Israel, and

1 November



The conference began with a series of addresses, firstly from H.E. President Gül of Turkey, who noted in his address to the conference that, “Turkey is located at the heart of the Afro-Eurasian axis, which is a critical geography in terms of disarmament and non-proliferation of weapons of mass destruction.”

This was followed by a panel on **International and Regional Security** featuring H.E. Mohammad Javad Zarif, Minister of Foreign Affairs of Iran and H.E. Ahmet Davutoğlu, Minister of Foreign Affairs of Turkey.

The Simons Symposium

The day continued with the Simons Symposium focused on *Weapons of Mass Destruction and their Elimination* sponsored by the Simons Foundation. The symposium featured Hon. Frank Rose, nominee for US Assistant Secretary of State, Arms Control and

Department for Security Affairs and Disarmament of Russia discussing “Perspectives on nuclear disarmament and the elimination of weapons of mass destruction.” Other panels similarly addressed both “Eliminating tactical nuclear weapons from Europe” and “Perspectives on the elimination of nuclear weapons.”

There was also a panel on “Eliminating nuclear weapons and other WMD from the Middle East: what next?” which addressed the 2010 NPT Review Conference commitment to make progress on establishing a WMD free zone in the region. The appointed Facilitator for this initiative, Amb. Jaakko Laajava, of the Ministry for Foreign Affairs (Finland) was joined by Amb. Wael Al-Assad, League of Arab States (Jordan) and Amb. Mohamed Shaker, Egyptian Council for Foreign Affairs (Egypt).



Dorothy Hodgkin Memorial Forum: Civil Society, Scientists, and Prospects for Syria's Future

This forum featured discussion of the unfolding crisis in Syria by Dr Rim Turkmani, a Dorothy Hodgkin Fellow of the Royal Society, Rime Allaf, a writer and adviser in Syria, Dr Hossein Adeli of the Ravand Institute in Iran, and Amb. Umit Yalcin of the Turkish Foreign Ministry. The speakers addressed the topics of ensuring a peaceful resolution that engaged all groups in Syrian society, highlighting the role that Pugwash and other organizations can play in bringing together civil society and in particular, the role of scientists for providing sound evidence for policymakers.



4 November 2013: Dr Rim Turkman (left) and Dr Hossein Adeli address the 60th Pugwash Conference

Special Feature:

The 60th Pugwash Conference in Istanbul

2-5 November: Plenary Sessions

Maintaining the non-proliferation regime and solving the Iranian nuclear controversy featured presentations from Dr. Seyed Kazem Sajjadpour, Strategy Adviser to Iran's Foreign Minister, Dr. Ali Vaez, International Crisis Group, and Dr. Tariq Rauf, President, Global Nuclear Solutions. Prof Steve Miller, chair of the Pugwash Executive Committee, chaired the panel.

The next panel focused on **Chemical Weapons**, featuring Amb. Sergey Batsanov, Pugwash Council, Amb. Ali Asghar Soltanieh and Dr. Paul Walker, Green Cross International. Council Member Jean-Pascal Zanders chaired.

During dinner the conference was privileged to have a special address by OPCW Deputy Director-General, Grace Asirwatham (Sri Lanka), followed by brief comments by Amb. Wael Al-Assad, League of Arab States.



Nuclear Energy Safety featured presentations from Mr. Behrouz Kamalvandi, (above) Deputy for International Affairs, Atomic Energy Organization (Iran) and Dr. Tatsujiro Suzuki, Vice Chair, Japan Atomic Energy Commission. The panel was chaired by Dr. Victor Gilinsky, former Commissioner of the Nuclear Regulatory Commission (US).

Israel-Palestine: The Future of the Two State Solution was chaired by Council Member Cliff Kupchan. Presentations were made by Hon. Dr. Nachman Shai, Member of Knesset (Israel), Dr. Husam Zomlot, Deputy, Foreign Relations Commission, Fateh (Palestine) followed by commentary from Prof. Galia Golan, Pugwash Council (Israel) and Dr. Nabil Shaath, Head, Foreign Relations Commission, Fateh (Palestine).

This was followed by **Unlocking Gaza in the Present Regional Environment**, chaired by Taghreed El-Khodary (Palestine) and featuring Dr. Nabil Shaath, Head, Foreign Relations Commission, Fateh (Palestine) and Dr. Azzam Tamimi, Islamic scholar (Palestine).

H.E. Salahuddin Rabbani, Chair, High Peace Council (Afghanistan), Amb. Robin Raphel, State Department (USA), Amb. Sherry Rehman, Jinnah Institute (Pakistan) assessed **Afghanistan After 2014**. Commentary was given by Amb. Rustam Shah Mohmand, former ambassador to Afghanistan (Pakistan) and A.S. Dulat, Former Secretary, Research & Analysis Wing (India).

Prospects for a Possible Convention on Cyberwarfare featured Prof. Dr. Goetz Neuneck, Pugwash Council (Germany) with comments by Dr. Gianpiero Siroli, University of Bologna (Italy) and chaired by Dr. Karen Hallberg, Pugwash Council (Argentina).

Hon. Ahmer Bilal Soofi, Advocate, Supreme Court of Pakistan, former Minister of Justice (Pakistan) and Amb. G. Parthasarathy, former High Commissioner to Pakistan (India) then had **India/Pakistan Dialogue**, Co-chaired by Prof. Amitabh Mattoo, Pugwash Council (India) and Lt. Gen (ret.) Talat Masood, Pugwash Council (Pakistan).

Finally there was a **Fukushima Colloquium**, chaired by Dr. Victor Gilinsky. This featured: Dr. Tatsujiro Suzuki, Vice Chair, Japan Atomic Energy Commission (Japan); Dr. Tomohiro Inagaki, Hiroshima University (Japan); and Prof. Susumu Shirabe, Nagasaki University School of Medicine (Japan)

2-4 July: Working Groups

Throughout the three days, participants engaged in structured private dialogue, the hallmark of Pugwash conferences, upon the following issues:

- 1—*Nuclear weapons and their elimination*
- 2—*Nuclear Energy and Security*
- 3—*Regional Security in the Middle East*
- 4—*India, Pakistan, and Afghanistan*
- 5—*Turkey and its Neighbors*
- 6—*Disarmament, conflict resolution and new weapons technology*
- 7—*From CW disarmament in Syria to a Middle East free from CW*

8th International Student/Young Pugwash Conference

The ISYP conference, *Conflict and Cooperation: The Global Impact of National and Regional Security Issues*, involved 25 participants, preceding the main Pugwash Conference.

Full reports of the working groups and further information on and videos of the plenary sessions are available at www.pugwash.org

Also available is a series of video interviews with Pugwashites

The Pugwash Council

President

*Jayantha Dhanapala

Secretary-General

*Paolo Cotta-Ramusino

Executive Director

Sandra Ionno Butcher

Chair of the Pugwash Council

*Saideh Lotfian

Chair of the Executive Committee

*Steve Miller

Members of the Pugwash Council:

Ochieng Adala (Kenya)

Hossein Adeli (Iran)

Wael Al-Assad (Jordan)

Haifa Baramki (Palestine)

Serguei Batsanov (Russia)

Adele Buckley (Canada)

Francesco Calogero (Italy)

Chen Huaifan (China)

Alexander Dynkin (Russia)

Sergio Duarte (Brazil)

Lynn Eden (USA)

*Rolf Ekeus (Sweden)

*Galia Golan (Israel)

Karen Hallberg (Argentina)

*Anissa E. Hassouna (Egypt)

Happymon Jacob (India)

Peter Jones (Canada)

Venance Journé (France)

Karim Kadry (Egypt)

Taghreed el-Khodary (Palestine)

Mustafa Kibaroglu (Turkey)

Cliff Kupchan (USA)

Yoshiko Kurita (Japan)

Francesco Lenci (Italy)

Patricia Lewis (Ireland)

*Li Bin (China)

Sverre Lodgaard (Norway)

Arnold Luethold (Switzerland)

Miguel Marin Bosch (Mexico)

Talat Masood (Pakistan)

*Amitabh Mattoo (India)

David Menashri (Israel)

Götz Neuneck (Germany)

Alexander Nikitin (Russia)

Pan Zhenqiang (China)

Ramamurti Rajaraman (India)

M. Abul Ahrar Ramizpoor

(Afghanistan)

Katariina Simonen (Finland)

Jennifer Allen Simons (Canada)

Ivo Slaus (Croatia)

Mark Suh (Republic of Korea)

*Tatsujiro Suzuki (Japan)

Christopher Watson (UK)

*Moeed Yusuf (Pakistan)

Jean-Pascal Zanders (Belgium)

Bozorgmehr Ziaran (Iran)

Aharon Zohar (Israel)

Husam Zomlot (Palestine)

Bob van der Zwaan (Netherlands)

(*indicates member of the Executive Committee)

Pugwash can be contacted at
info@pugwash.org

Please see our website
www.pugwash.org
for full details on all our activities
and reports of previous work.

Donors

Pugwash is grateful to all of its supporters, in particular to the grant donors who have contributed to the on-going vitality of the organisation. Pugwash is a not-for-profit organisation with a highly streamlined structure – as such, the vast majority of expenditure goes toward the Track 2 dialogue that is our hallmark *modus operandi*.

Funders for projects carried out over the past two years:

The Carnegie Corporation
The Cyrus Eaton Foundation
National Pugwash Groups
The Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs

The Simons Foundation
Strategic Research Center
Turkish Ministry of Foreign Affairs
The UK Foreign and Commonwealth Office
United States Institute of Peace