

# Triennial Report on Activities

2010-2012

The Pugwash  
Conferences  
on Science  
and World  
Affairs



Nobel Peace Prize 1995





Since its founding in 1957, the goal of the PUGWASH CONFERENCES ON SCIENCE AND WORLD AFFAIRS has been primarily to warn against the risk that the use of nuclear weapons could destroy civilization and possibly mankind. In particular, Pugwash advocates nuclear disarmament, eliminating all weapons of mass destruction (WMD), and preventing nuclear proliferation. As Pugwash has adapted to the post-Cold War world, we also focus on facilitating conflict resolution by means of dialogue, particularly by engaging a wide range of policy makers, leaders, and scientists, especially in regions where nuclear weapons are a security issue.

Pugwash workshops engage current and former policy makers and opinion shapers who participate in their personal capacities, according to Pugwash/Chatham House rules (the substance can be reported out but not attributed to any one person). Because of this arrangement, our workshops tend to produce insightful and targeted recommendations that often find their way into the corridors of power through reports and personal post-workshop meetings and briefings.

Pugwash has national groups and close contacts in some 50 countries, and offices in Rome, London, Washington DC, and Geneva



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Message from the Secretary General and President .....	3
<i>Feature: 2013 Activities</i> .....	3
<i>Special Feature: 59<sup>th</sup> Pugwash Conference, Berlin, July 2011</i> ..	4
<i>Activities by issue area:</i>	
Nuclear Disarmament .....	6
<i>Focus: A Middle East Free of WMD</i> .....	6
The Middle East .....	7
<i>Focus: The Iranian nuclear issue</i> .....	7
South Asia .....	8
<i>Focus: Afghanistan</i> .....	8
Chemical and Biological Weapons .....	9
Pugwash History .....	9
Pugwash Organisational Structure .....	10
Pugwash Donors .....	10

# A Message from the Secretary General and President

As we look forward to the 60<sup>th</sup> Pugwash Conference in Istanbul in October 2013, this report summarises the wide range of activities undertaken since 2010.

The past three years have seen great strides for Pugwash as an organisation. We have adapted to the new political and security challenges in the key regions in which we work, while still maintaining a focus on ways to achieve a world free of nuclear weapons and other weapons of mass destruction. The 59th Pugwash Conference in Berlin was among the highest level meetings we have had, demonstrating the relevance, great interest, and wide support for the work we are doing.

Our work in the Middle East has been credited with injecting thoughtful suggestions into often very tense regional environments. Our work in helping policymakers to better appreciate the perspectives of people in other regions has, we are told, been effective. In particular, our focus on maintaining relations and fostering dialogue between the West and Iran in respect of its nuclear programme has been widely appreciated in that country and the region more widely, most recently with the presentation of a model framework agreement.

In general, as the Middle East has undergone ground breaking political and social upheaval, we have continued to promote cooperation and communication

major presidential candidates and political leaders. They include cutting edge discussion with leaders of the youth movement and others.

In South Asia we continue to foster cooperation between the political and military establishments of India and Pakistan, with many groundbreaking meetings including the visit of Indian Parliamentarians to Islamabad in May 2011. In Afghanistan, Pugwash has conducted many consultations to promote peaceful reconciliation between all parties, including retaining a regional approach which is mindful of the role that India and Pakistan must play for stability in this volatile part of the world.

In Europe and North America, Pugwash continues to pressure and inform political constituents and the public of the goal for a nuclear weapons free world. The fact is that nuclear weapons still carry significant political weight throughout the world and that more must be done on both nuclear disarmament and non-proliferation to reduce the salience of nuclear weapons as political symbols.

Pugwash, as an organisation, relies on the goodwill of all those who attend and participate in its meetings. We are also indebted to those who continue to provide funding for the important work we undertake throughout the world.



**Pugwash President  
Jayantha Dhanapala**



**Pugwash Secretary General  
Paolo Cotta-Ramusino**

## *Sample 2013 Activities are already underway:*

**Meeting on Afghan reconciliation,  
Dubai, 15-17 January 2013**

**Consultation on Iran, Washington  
D.C., 28 February 2013**

**Conference on Jammu Kashmir  
(Summer 2013), Islamabad**

**60<sup>th</sup> Pugwash Conference, Istanbul  
(October 2013)**

Reports of these and other meetings are available on our website  
[www.pugwash.org](http://www.pugwash.org)

# The 59<sup>th</sup> Pugwash Conference: Berlin, 1-4 July 2011



From 1-4 July 2011, The Pugwash Conferences on Science and World Affairs convened the 59th Pugwash Conference, at the German Federal Foreign Office, Berlin: **“European Contributions to Nuclear Disarmament and Conflict Resolution”** created a space for 350 people from 43 countries to sit together and discuss key issues on the international and regional agendas. Participants included acting government officials, former government or diplomatic members, scientists, media and other opinion formers from all sides, and young Pugwashites from science and academia.

In the current, complex international environment, Pugwash continues to focus on the need to decrease the salience of nuclear weapons, to promote further significant reductions in existing arsenals, and to avoid the proliferation of nuclear weapons. Pugwash also promotes conflict prevention and resolution in areas of nuclear risk, including through ground-breaking work in South

Asia (including historic meetings in Kashmir and current high-level Track II meetings between senior Indians and Pakistanis) and the Middle East (featuring high level meetings on Iran, Israel, the WMD Free Zone in the Middle East and other topics).



Berlin provided a unique city to discuss many of the themes traditional to a Pugwash conference. As Pugwash Secretary General Prof Paolo Cotta-Ramusino commented, “If walls could come down in Berlin, then we also have the possibility to solve challenging issues in other parts of the world”.

## The Simons Symposium

The conference began on 1 July with a day-long event, the Simons Symposium, focused on *European Security and Nuclear Disarmament*, which was co-sponsored by the European Leadership Network,

The Simons Foundation, and Pugwash. The symposium began with a keynote address by the German Federal Minister for Foreign Affairs, Dr Guido Westerwelle, who welcomed the signs of progress the international community has made on nuclear disarmament and non-proliferation commitments made at the beginning of this decade. In keeping with the theme of the conference, he went on to note “that probably the greatest European contribution to global security is peace in Europe itself.”

Recognising that there are of course divergent perspectives within Europe and NATO but that the dialogue between these blocs and Russia must continue if we are to make progress on nuclear disarmament, the Symposium featured a number of panels during the day: firstly on *Europe and Nuclear Weapons: What Progress in Nuclear Disarmament?*, a second on *Europe, NATO and Russia: the Search for Cooperative Security.*; and lastly, *Further Steps in Nuclear Reductions.*



## Dorothy Hodgkin Lecture: The Fukushima Nuclear Accident: Lessons Learned (so far) and Possible Implications

Dr Tatsuro Suzuki, the Vice Chairman of Japan’s Atomic Energy Commission described the situation in Japan just months after the Fukushima nuclear accident and spelled out a number of important lessons the international community should take from this experience. The event was chaired by Prof. Saideh Lotfian, Chair of the Pugwash Council and featured Dr. Victor Gilinsky, former Commissioner of the US Nuclear Regulatory Commission, as the discussant.



4 July 2011: Dr Suzuki (right) addresses the 59<sup>th</sup> Pugwash Conference

# The 59<sup>th</sup> Pugwash Conference: Berlin, 1-4 July 2011

## 2-4 July: Plenary Sessions

The following three days featured a number of panel presentations from current and former officials and Pugwash members, across the spectrum of Pugwash activities.

**Iranian Nuclear Policy** featured presentations from Iranian Ambassadors Ali Asghar Soltanieh and Alireza Sheikh Attar, as well as from Prof Steve Miller, chair of the Pugwash Executive Committee. The panel was chaired by Pugwash council member Dr Peter Jones.



Dr Rose Gottemoeller of the US State Department then presented **What Progress on the CTBT?**, a panel chaired by Pugwash Council member Amb. Sergey Batsanov.

**What Future for Palestine? How Can Europe Help?** saw a dialogue between Prof. Avishay Braverman of the Israeli Knesset and Dr Husam Zomlot of the Fatah party in Palestine, chaired by Amb Rolf Ekeus.



Amb. Sergio Duarte of the UN chaired **Eliminating WMD in the Middle East**, which featured Amb Wael Al-Assad of the Arab League, Amb. Jeremy Issacharoff of Israel and HE Khalid Shamaa of Egypt.

During dinner on 2 July, Mr Martin Butcher of Oxfam introduced a

## *Dialogue on the Arms Trade Treaty*

with short interventions from Amb John Duncan of the UK and Mr Thomas Schultz-Jagow of Oxfam.

Chaired by Mr Martin Kobler of the UN, **Prospects for Conflict Resolution in Afghanistan** brought together HE Mohammad Masoom Stanekzai of Afghanistan, Amb Michael Steiner of Germany, Amb Willaim Taylor of the USIP, and Mullah Abdul Salam Zaeef of Afghanistan.



**Improving Relations between India and Pakistan** featured Hon. Ahsan Iqbal Chaudhry and Hon. Sherry Rehman, both of the Pakistan Parliament, and Hon. Syed Azeez Pasha and Prof. Saifuddin Soz, both of the Indian Parliament. The panel was chaired by Lt Gen (ret) Talat Masood and Prof. Amitabh Mattoo, co-Chairs of the Pugwash India-Pakistan Independent Commission.

HE Hussain al-Shahristani of Iraq, HE Nabil Shaath of Palestine, and Dr. Abdel Monem Said of Egypt discussed **Problems and Opportunities in the Changing Middle East**, chaired by Prof Paolo Cotta-Ramusino, Pugwash Secretary General.

## 2-4 July: Working Groups

Throughout the three days, participants engaged in structured private dialogue, the hallmark of

Pugwash conferences, upon the following issues:

- 1: *Nuclear Disarmament and Non-proliferation (after the 2010 NPT Review Conference)*
- 2: *Prospects for Peace and Security in the Middle East.*
- 3: *Regional Stability in Central and South Asia: The situation in Afghanistan, and Indo-Pakistani relations*
- 4: *European Security and Disarmament*
- 5: *Social Responsibility of Scientists*
- 6: *Climate Change, Resources, and Conflict Prevention*

Pugwash meetings include ample time for relaxed social interaction over special dinners and outings. The Berlin conference featured many such opportunities, on a cruise along the river, in historic restaurants, and by housing all participants in the same hotel. Pugwash has a lean but very experienced central staff that worked in cooperation with the VDW (German Pugwash Group) and other local volunteers to make this conference possible.



**29-30 June 2011 7th International Student/Young Pugwash Conference** A special International Student/Young Pugwash (ISYP) conference, *Conflict and Cooperation – The Global Impact of Regional Security Efforts*, involved 32 students and young professionals from 28 countries, preceding the main Pugwash Conference.

*"We have to learn to think in a new way"*  
1955 Russell-Einstein Manifesto

# Nuclear Disarmament

The overarching Pugwash goal is a peaceful world free of nuclear weapons and other weapons of mass destruction. Indeed, the long-term vision put forward in the 'founding' document of Pugwash, the 1955 Russell-Einstein Manifesto, is a world without war. Our strategy is to continue to promote that vision widely, while working to create dialogue across divides on steps needed to achieve that end. We get beyond the rhetoric and entrenched positions by fostering dialogue on ways in which working toward these goals can increase the security of all sides.



Pugwash continues its more traditional work promoting arms control and disarmament measures, including our long-term and influential support for efforts to reinforce the norm in favor of a nuclear weapons free world. We seek to advance European security



through next steps in confidence building, arms control, disarmament and NATO-Russia security cooperation, including a November 2012 conference in Moscow and an August 2012 meeting in Pugwash, Canada. Concern about existing arsenals and possible future proliferation, necessitates discussions on broader security issues and perceived threats. The role of outside players (including the US, Europe, and NATO) to our other core regions of interest are an integral part of these discussions. We held roundtables on these topics in London (January 2010), DC (February 2010) and Moscow (April 2010) involving former UK Defence Secretary Des Browne and other former ministers engaged in the newly emerging European Leadership Network.

Pugwash was actively involved in preparations for and participation

at the 2010 NPT Review Conference. Our January 2010 'Milan Document on Nuclear Disarmament and Non-Proliferation' paved the way for an important Pugwash Briefing Booklet which was disseminated widely before and during the Review Conference in New York. Pugwash held many consultations during that month, drawing attention to the need for a consensual Final Document and support for implementation of the 1995 Resolution on the Middle East. Indeed, the acknowledgement in the document of "the important role played by civil society in contributing to the implementation of the resolution" is an encouragement to Pugwash to continue its efforts.

Pugwash continues to press for a better understanding of what each country can do concretely to create an environment conducive to the Entry into Force of the Comprehensive Test Ban Treaty. We published a report on this in January 2010. Pugwash is uniquely placed to encourage discussion on this issue and does so in specially-focused meetings as well as regional consultations.

## ***Focus: A Middle East Free of Weapons of Mass Destruction***

Pugwash continues to promote the goal of a zone free of all nuclear and other weapons of mass destruction in the Middle East. This project straddles our two activity areas on nuclear disarmament and the Middle East in providing a forum for all regional states to discuss their security concerns. Including a major workshop at Farnham Castle, UK, in October 2010, we have pushed the issue forward at the NPT Review Conference, and have actively participated in meetings throughout 2011-12, most recently in Beirut (September 2012). At our Berlin conference, WMD in the Middle East was a major focus for panel sessions and the working group. All of our regional meetings, including in Israel and Palestine, retain discussion on the regional implications of this initiative.



Farnham Castle meeting, October 2010

# The Middle East

The main objective of the Pugwash Extended Middle East Dialogue Project has been to provide a forum that can respond flexibly and effectively when changes in the international and domestic political situations in the region cry out for new thinking and creative approaches. Given the historic changes that the region has experienced in the past three years, Pugwash has had to remain engaged at the highest levels and respond to the rapidly developing environment when planning and organising its meetings. We have contributed to an environment that promotes dialogue over armed confrontation by engaging high level officials from all regional states.



However, the Middle East is a region characterised by obstacles to dialogue, whether between states of the region or with outside parties. Despite increasing tensions in the

region, the importance of our efforts is not diminished and Pugwash has continued to enable channels of communication throughout this period. Pugwash created opportunities for people from this very tense regional environment to meet across dividing lines.

In a number of meetings in Gaza and the West Bank in early 2012, Pugwash has discussed the future of Palestine with Fatah and Hamas, and encouraged parties to consider the regional security situation. A characteristic concern raised at these meetings was the danger that both the Arab Spring and the Iranian nuclear issue were eclipsing focus on the Israel-Palestine issue.

Through a series of workshops and consultations in these three years, Pugwash has fostered greater understanding within Israel of Iranian perceptions of the region's tensions and geo-strategic security environment. This series also provided an opportunity to continue discussion on Israel-Palestine relations, and Israeli perspectives on the Arab Spring.

Our October 2011 meeting in Cairo engaged major presidential candidates and political leaders in a

cutting-edge discussion with leaders of the youth movement and others.

This dialogue included a focus on the possible role of political Islam in a future Egyptian constitution as well as the interaction of Islam and Islamic political culture with the international community, with the meeting involving senior members of the Islamic Movements (Harakat Islamiya).



Despite the obvious attention on the rapidly changing political environment in the region, we have strived to maintain a dimension of discussion on the regional security situation in all of our meetings. Following the NPT Review Conference of May 2010, Pugwash pursued a regional dialogue on the outcomes with a particular focus on the call for a 2012 Conference on a Weapons of Mass Destruction (WMD) Free Zone in the Middle East (see the 'focus' box above, p.6).

## ***Focus: The Iranian Nuclear Issue***

Pugwash promotes a peaceful and non-military resolution of the Iranian nuclear issue by engaging key individuals from all sides to foster regional dialogue. Pugwash has promoted a model framework agreement as a way to emphasize technical solutions to the problems exist if political will is present. We have held a series of meetings in Israel on this issue, along with related meetings in Paris, London, DC, Beirut, and many private meetings in relevant capitals, including Tehran, Moscow, and China. Pugwash seeks to promote greater understanding of the threat perceptions for all sides through this series of consultations and roundtables. In all its meetings, Pugwash involves well respected scientists with the relevant expertise who provide context for policy-makers.



Herzliya, Israel, January 2012.  
Consultation on Iran

# South Asia

Pugwash has remained deeply involved in South Asia, organizing track-II dialogues on Kashmir, regional relations, the future of Afghanistan, and confidence building measures about nuclear weapons and military cooperation. Instability in the region is profound, given the situation in Afghanistan, and the current low ebb of the India-Pakistan strategic relationship. Pugwash has stressed the need to create a counter-narrative to continuing conflict.



Continuing work from 2009, Pugwash maintained the track-II effort that sought to bring together Pakistani and American experts to discuss Pakistan-US ties, arguably one of the most critical and complex interstate relations today. The manner in which both military operations and political cooperation continue to be conducted, notably in the assassination of Bin Laden,

demonstrate the necessity for on-going engagement on this track.



Beginning with a meeting in July 2010, Pugwash initiated a set of meetings highlighting an array of recommendations on how to support a process of dialogue at the official level. Across the diverse perspectives of the participants, there was a shared commitment to and sense of urgency for "track two" unofficial dialogue, and a hope that discussions begun in Islamabad might contribute in some small way to fostering an environment conducive to progress in the "track one" or intergovernmental dialogue.

The meetings have continued with the belief that it is crucial that dialogue between Pakistan and India can reduce tensions in this region and promote a spirit of cooperation and stability. The participants, including prominent

current and former policy makers, diplomats, military and intelligence experts, and media analysts, felt strongly that the two countries are on the cusp of a bilateral, normalized relationship, and recognized that there is a public yearning for peace

Over the course of a number of meetings in Dubai, Islamabad and Delhi, and numerous consultations in the region and Washington D.C., Pugwash has produced a series of concrete steps that the high level participants have been able to take back to their respective governments.



The process included the first ever all-MPs Indian delegation to visit Pakistan to advance the process of peace-building in the region, in May 2011, facilitated by Pugwash. We acknowledge the vital contribution to this series of meetings from both Vertic and USIP.

## *Focus: Afghanistan*

The situation in Afghanistan a decade after the US-led invasion remains highly unstable. Tensions between Afghanistan and Pakistan are also significant, with terrorist activities inflaming an already volatile relationship. Through continuing consultations in the region, Pugwash strives to promote dialogue between factions within Afghanistan and among states of the region, recognizing the pivotal position it occupies in that part of the world. Furthermore, Pugwash has organised two key meetings involving participants of different Afghan groups, most recently in September 2012 and January 2013 in Dubai. These aim at promoting reconciliation of all different sides of Afghan society (including people connected with insurgents).



Participants at the 59<sup>th</sup> Pugwash Conference, panel "Prospects for Conflict Resolution in Afghanistan"

# Chemical and Biological Weapons

In keeping with the organisation's commitment to ridding the world of all weapons of mass destruction, Pugwash retains a stake in the international processes focused on eliminating chemical and biological weapons. Continuing a tradition dating back to the 1950s, a Pugwash Study Group was convened to study and discuss the governance of chemical and biological weapons and provide input into international forums.

As such, the Group held a major workshop, the 34th Workshop of the Pugwash Study Group, on 'Implementation of the Chemical and Biological Weapons Conventions: Maximising Benefits in the Intersessional Period 2012-2015 and Beyond', on the 8-9 December 2012, in Geneva, Switzerland. Previously, the groups had organised 'Achieving Realistic Decisions at the Seventh BWC Review Conference in 2011', in December 2011. Following this, the Steering Committee of the Pugwash Study Group on the Implementation of the Chemical and Biological Weapons Conventions participated in and provided a set of recommendations to the Seventh Review Conference of the States Parties to the Biological and Toxin Weapons Convention in Geneva, Switzerland, in December 2011. Prior to this, the Pugwash Study Group had also held planning meetings in April 2011 in Noordwijk, The Netherlands, for a workshop 'The OPCW in Transition', and also in December 2010.

# Pugwash History

With over 50 years of ground-breaking meetings and work, the History Project serves to detail the events and contributions that the organisation has made. We welcomed the Canadian government announcement of significant grants toward Phase Two restoration of philanthropist Cyrus Eaton's Thinkers' Lodge, where the historic first Pugwash Conference took place in 1957 in Pugwash, Nova Scotia. Sandra Ionno Butcher, in her capacity as director of the Pugwash History Project, is serving on the Thinkers' Lodge Advisory Committee, which has also engaged John Eaton, Chairman of the Pugwash Park Commission, to discuss plans for Thinkers' Lodge and possible future projects.

In November 2010, Eric Bednarski and Barry Cowling were awarded Canada's most prestigious prize for best writing in a documentary program for *The Strangest Dream*, National Film Board of Canada's film about Joseph Rotblat and Pugwash. Earlier that year, the Collected Papers of Joseph Rotblat and the Pugwash Conferences were made open to the public at Churchill Archives of Cambridge University.

Sandra Butcher also maintains a blog with the aim of encouraging dialogue about the history of Pugwash, <http://pugwashhistory.blogspot.co.uk/>. Plans are underway to upgrade the history sections of the website.

## Information on Pugwash National Groups

Since its creation, Pugwash has always had affiliated but independent national groups. Currently, national groups exist in some 50 countries around the world. Each year they organize a series of activities that range from promotion of an Arctic Nuclear Weapons Free Zone to Energy Security in the Middle East. The national group structure provides the flexibility for each group to develop its own areas of interest. Often, the international Pugwash secretariat works closely with national groups on various workshops and relies upon the extensive networks of local contacts to succeed in its work.

# The Pugwash Organisation

## **President**

Amb. Jayantha Dhanapala

Prof. Karen Hallberg

Prof. Ivo Slaus

## **Secretary-General**

Prof Paolo Cotta-Ramusino

Dr. Peter Jones

Prof. Takao Takahara

## **Chair of the Pugwash Council**

Prof Saideh Lotfian

Mr. Cliff Kupchan

[We extend our gratitude to Prof. Marie Muller and Dr. Jeffrey Boutwell, who rotated off the Council in July 2011]

## **Chair of the Executive Committee**

Prof Steve Miller

Mr. Sverre Lodgaard

Prof. Saideh Lotfian

Dr. Riad Malki

Amb. Miguel Marin-Bosch

General Talat Masood

**Pugwash can be contacted at**

[info@pugwash.org](mailto:info@pugwash.org)

## **Members of the Pugwash Council**

Amb. Ochieng Adala

Prof. Amitabh Mattoo

Amb. Sergey Batsanov

Dr. Steven Miller

Dr. Adele Buckley

Prof. Dr. Götz Neuneck

Dr. Lynn Eden

Dr. Alexander Nikitin

Prof. John Finney

Mr. Niu Qiang

Prof. Galia Golan-Gild

Acad. Yuri Ryzhov

Dr. Mark Byung-Moon Suh

**Please see our website**

[www.pugwash.org](http://www.pugwash.org)

**for full details on all our activities and reports of previous work.**

## Donors

Pugwash is grateful to all of its supporters, in particular to the grant donors who have contributed to the on-going vitality of the organisation. Pugwash is a not-for-profit organisation with a highly streamlined structure – as such, the vast majority of expenditure goes toward the track-2 dialogue that is our hallmark *modus operandi*.

### Funders for projects carried out over the past three years:

The Carnegie Corporation

The Ploughshares Fund

Connect US Fund

OXFAM

The Eaton Foundation

The Simons Foundation

Heathside Charitable Trust

The UK Foreign and Commonwealth Office

The German Federal Ministry of Foreign Affairs

US Department of State

National Pugwash Groups

United States Institute of Peace

The Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs

VERTIC